Symmetry breaking and geometric confinement in VO$_2$: Results from a three-dimensional infrared nano-imaging

Mengkun Liu, Martin Wagner, Jingdi Zhang, Alexander McLeod, Salinporn Kittiwanakul, Zhe Fei, Elsa Abreu, Michael Goldflam, Aaron J. Sternbach, Siyuan Dai, Kevin G. West, Jiwei Lu, Stuart A. Wolff, Richard D. Averitt, and D. N. Basov

1Department of Physics, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, California 92093, USA
2Department of Physics, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts 02215, USA
3Department of Physics, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, Virginia 22904, USA
4Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, Virginia 22904, USA

(Received 31 October 2013; accepted 11 March 2014; published online 25 March 2014)

Epitaxial strain can play an important role in controlling the local phase dynamics of transition metal oxides. With scattering-type scanning near-field optical microscopy, we visualize the three-dimensional landscape of phase inhomogeneity in strained VO$_2$ films grown on [100]$_R$ TiO$_2$ substrates. We demonstrate that three different symmetries are spontaneously broken in the vicinity of the VO$_2$ phase transition: (1) Monoclinic-tetragonal (rutile) crystal symmetry breaking due to the structural phase transition, (2) in-plane (x-y plane) rotational symmetry breaking due to the formation of periodic strain domains, and (3) out-of-plane (z-axis) mirror symmetry breaking at the film cross-section due to substrate-induced epitaxial strain.

Symmetry-breaking phase transitions are ubiquitous phenomena in condensed matter physics. In strongly correlated electron materials, broken symmetries can result in mesoscopic separation of multiple phases in the course of a solid-solid phase transition.\(^1\)\(^-\)\(^7\) Uniaxial strain, as a controllable parameter, can be exploited as a versatile tool to modify and tune the domain texture associated with the underlying symmetry change induced by lattice distortion.\(^4\) Compared to other phase control mechanisms such as electrostatic gating,\(^8\) ultrafast photoexcitation,\(^9\)\(^10\) and magnetic field switching,\(^7\) strain has the distinct advantage of leading to a three-dimensional (3D) geometric modification yielding well-defined changes in the local environment. In order to intuitively understand the strain behavior and to clarify its role in compounds displaying a symmetry-breaking metal-insulator transition (MIT), it is imperative to monitor the 3D evolution of the structural and electronic properties of canonical phase change materials under substantial strain. The sample material chosen for this study, vanadium dioxide (VO$_2$), exhibits a phase transition temperature ($T_c$) close to room temperature ($340\,\text{K}$) and serves as an ideal candidate.\(^11\)

Recent advances in the fabrication and characterization of high quality VO$_2$ crystals with various substrates and geometrical configurations have finally allowed for microscopic control of this material, helping to unravel the intrinsic physics of its metal-insulator transition\(^12\)\(^-\)\(^15\) that has eluded a complete description for decades. For example, tremendous effort has been made in studying free standing/supported VO$_2$ nanobeams and nanoplatelets.\(^14\)\(^-\)\(^25\) Under external strain, these geometrically constrained VO$_2$ systems reveal unique patterns of structural and electronic domain formation which are also of interest in the context of potential applications.\(^17\)\(^,\)\(^26\) In unstrained polycrystalline VO$_2$ films, the percolation process dominates through the phase transition, and the metallic puddles are randomly distributed.\(^12\) However, in strained epitaxial VO$_2$ films, the phase separation involves formation of unidirectional mesoscopic stripes.\(^27\) In this work, we investigate the evolution of stripe patterns in strained VO$_2$ films (on [100]$_R$ TiO$_2$ substrates) in greater detail. Using IR near-field microscopy, we directly visualize the spontaneous 3D distribution of unidirectional metallic domains and reveal that the formation of the stripe state is governed by the crystal symmetry as well as geometric confinement. Specifically, we visualize two important processes: (i) The percolation and orientation of metallic stripes along the monoclinic c axis and (ii) strain-induced metallic nucleation build-up at the sample-substrate interface. We also demonstrate that the orientational preference of these stripes and the occurrence of complex domain patterns such as domain junctions and bifurcations depend strongly on the lateral geometry of the crystals. In cases of strong lateral confinement, the stripe patterns retrieve the character of VO$_2$ nanobeams.\(^15\)\(^,\)\(^21\)\(^,\)\(^28\)

One unique way to study 3D dielectric properties of materials, as first demonstrated here, is by using scattering-type scanning near-field optical microscopy (s-SNOM). Based on a hybrid of an atomic force microscope (AFM) and an infrared (IR) laser, s-SNOM enables the study of optical properties of materials at nanometer length scale.\(^29\)\(^,\)\(^30\) In our apparatus, IR light pulses are generated through difference-frequency generation (DFG) with a 40 MHz Er fiber oscillator. The pulses are focused onto the AFM tip, and the amplitude of the back-scattered IR electric field is demodulated at different harmonics ($n = 1, 2, 3, \ldots$) of the tip’s tapping frequency to yield “near-field signals” $S_n$. Higher harmonic signals ($n = 2, 3, 4, \ldots$) reflect the genuine near-field interaction between the tip and the sample.
surface, and therefore contain information on the local dielectric properties. The s-SNOM approach affords optical resolution down to 10–20 nm (limited only by the AFM tip radius): A virtue routinely employed in IR nano-imaging and spectroscopy.\textsuperscript{29–32} We show that this technique is equally well suited for probing cross-sectional properties of thin film samples.

In Fig. 1, we schematically show “planar” and “cross-sectional” nano-imaging modalities. Fig. 1(a) presents the “planar” procedure: A commonplace scheme for s-SNOM measurements. We note that instead of a temperature controlled sample stage, here we can introduce an additional near-IR pump beam with a wavelength of 1.56 μm to thermally excite the film.\textsuperscript{33} In order to investigate the sample cross-section at elevated temperatures, the thin film sample can also be cleaved and mounted “vertically” on a temperature controlled stage (Fig. 1(b)). Cross-sectional raster scans yield AFM and near-field signals that reveal the evolution of the film properties from the substrate/sample interface to the sample surface. Note that the sample is intentionally tilted by a small angle so that one can simultaneously study the substrate, the film cross-section, and the adjacent sample surface.

The 250 nm VO\textsubscript{2} films studied in this work were deposited on a [100]\textsubscript{R} TiO\textsubscript{2} substrate.\textsuperscript{34} Room temperature X-ray diffraction (XRD) experiments confirm their single-crystal nature and identify the lattice parameters of these samples. The XRD results (not shown) are indicative of a compressive strain along \textit{b}_R ([010]\textsubscript{R}) and a tensile strain along \textit{c}_R ([001]\textsubscript{R}), in agreement with previous studies.\textsuperscript{35,36} The relatively large film thickness (250 nm) leads to strain release, therefore causing the formation of cracks that occur along the rutile \textit{c}_R axis ([001]\textsubscript{R}), as identified by both AFM and scanning electron microscopy (SEM).\textsuperscript{36} The micro-beams formed between the cracks have widths (W) ranging from \sim 0.5 to 5 μm (cracks that define beam widths are marked by white dashed lines in Figs. 2 and 3).

In Fig. 2, we present the main findings of this work: Pump induced spontaneous symmetry breaking in a 250 nm VO\textsubscript{2} film. Figs. 2(a)–2(c) show pump-sequence dependent near-field and AFM images acquired at the same location of the VO\textsubscript{2} surface. The 18.8 mW near-IR pump, which locally elevates the sample temperature to \sim 334 K (temperature assignment described in SI), induces a highly oriented stripe state as revealed by the near-field S3 images and the AFM topography. In these images, the metallic stripes show a herringbone pattern with two distinct orientations.
orientations, forming ~57° angles with mirror symmetry. This finding is consistent with the two equivalent in-plane orientations of the monoclinic c axis. However, it differs from both our previous study or from the cases of VO2 nanobeams in which the orientation of the stripes was aligned along the crystal axis of the rutile phase. Quickly blocking the pump beam for less than 1 s and then re-illuminating the region of interest under the identical conditions erases the initial pattern and produces a new, reconstructed pattern in both S3 and AFM images. The newly formed patterns conform to the same possible directions (+57° or −57°) but otherwise bear no resemblance to the initial patterns. Therefore, the images in Fig. 2 are indicative of a spontaneous symmetry breaking phase separation.

These results are further confirmed by the spontaneous lattice domain reformation in the AFM images, always acquired simultaneously with the near-field measurements.

We propose that a Landau-like free elastic energy analysis can qualitatively depict our observations of the formation of the two symmetric stripe states in VO2. This same argument was originally introduced for perovskite manganite systems. As the material goes through a transition from a parent phase to a distorted phase of lower symmetry, long-range elastic modes couple to the allowed short range modes (M0 and M1), yielding two energy minima with equal potentials and mirror symmetry. In our case, the two energy minima correspond to two different monoclinic c-axis orientations with mirror symmetry at ~57° with respect to the rutile c axis (see Fig. 2(d) and also online supplementary materials). An immediate implication of this scenario is the existence of two spontaneously oriented vanadium–vanadium (V–V) dimer pairs with mirror symmetry in the monoclinic state. In order to clarify the nature of the three coexistent states in our VO2 samples (57° and −57° monoclinic together with the rutile state), in Fig. 2(e), we display one possible lattice geometry which breaks symmetry in the [100]k plane. The green arrows indicate the movement of vanadium atoms, and the green lines are V–V dimer pairs. Symmetry breaking during the formation of V–V dimer pairs together with monoclinic (blue)–rutile (red) phase coexistence can lead to the long-range herringbone pattern we observe in our near-field imaging.

Fig. 2 clearly demonstrates that the observed phase separation does not arise from a permanent “built-in” strain field but rather is a spontaneous cooperative process. This process also closely resembles a Martensitic transformation under uniaxial strain. In the following, we present a detailed 3D near-field imaging study at the surface and the cross-section of the film, in order to grasp a deeper understanding of the strain induced geometric phase separation and symmetry breaking.

In Fig. 3, we present pump power dependent near-field images taken at three different locations across the VO2 film surface. We have observed several interesting features due to the presence of the cracks and the variation of the beam width (W) along the c-axis: (1) At relatively low pump power, the metallic stripes emerge mainly at the center of the micro-beams (Figs. 3(a) and 3(b)); (2) the average periodicity of the stripes (D) and their orientation varies systematically with the width of the beams (W) (Figs. 3(b) and 3(c)). In the narrowest beams (W < 1 μm), the stripes align nearly perpendicular to the cR axis (see Figs. 3(b) and 3(c)), consistent with earlier reports on VO2 nanobeams. (3) The domain bifurcations/junctions, where stripes with identical/distinct orientations intersect, can only be observed in micro-beams with large widths (W > 1 μm) (see also Fig. 2). In beams with small widths (W < 1 μm), the system is geometrically confined and, therefore, free of complex domain structures.

The systematic relationship between W, D, and x revealed by our images is plotted in Fig. 3(e). Here, x is the averaged fraction of the metallic phase, defined by x = D/W, where D is the averaged width of the metallic stripes. It is clear that with decreasing W, the domain-wall energy gradually suppresses the elastic misfit energy due to epitaxial strain release, leading to a reorientation of the stripes and increasing D to minimize the domain-wall energy. For the beams with smallest widths, this trend reduces to the behavior reported in nanobeams.

Fig. 4 shows cross-sectional s-SNOM images of the film acquired using the procedure described in Fig. 1(b). To elucidate the importance of strain, we focus our discussion on representative data collected at 335 K, five degrees below the bulk transition temperature (Tc ≈ 340 K). Three adjacent regions are shown with characteristic near-field (S3) cross section patterns: A line (upper right), a triangle (middle), and a trapezoid (lower left). Since a larger value in the near-field signal (S3) corresponds directly to a higher IR conductivity, metallic nucleation at the film cross section and its adjacent film surface can be mapped out through these images. From Fig. 4, it is evident that the nucleation pattern varies between different locations. Nevertheless, within all the cross-section regions we studied, metallic nucleation preferentially occurs at the film/substrate interface where the epitaxial strain is the strongest. These metallic regions can extend up to the sample surface, where a stripe-like pattern emerges in the plane of the film (e.g., sample surface at the lower left of Fig. 4).

Since the sample temperature was maintained at T < Tbulk (Tbulk = 340 K), defined as the critical insulator to metallic transition (335 K), the VO2 film thickness is ~250 nm. Three representative images composing the near field signal (S3) reveal epitaxial strain-induced metallic stripe nucleation though the VO2 cross-section and at the adjacent sample surface. Note that the schematic AFM cantilever is not to scale.
metal phase transition temperature at the bulk limit without strain), the patterns defined by the emergent metallic domains in Figs. 2–4 allow us to visualize the local strain induced phase transition. Our observations show that higher epitaxial strain along cR axis promotes nucleation of local metallic regions at: $T_{\text{local}} < T_{\text{bulk}}$. We register these effects in the vicinity of the VO$_2$/TiO$_2$ interface and at the center of VO$_2$ micro-beams. These observations suggest that the local strain at these nucleated regions is highly compressive along cR axis despite the fact that the global strain is tensile along cR. This alternation of the local tensile-compressive-tensile strain environment leads to the observed variations in nucleation temperature $T_{\text{local}}$. Therefore, a macroscopic transition temperature $T_{\text{global}}$ is not sufficient to describe the complicated phase transition in a strained thin film.$^{49-56}$ Use of the nomenclature $T_{\text{local}}$ is more appropriate and may serve as key for interpreting the macroscopic properties of strained films.

Our results have demonstrated that performing both cross-sectional and planar near-field mapping enables a nanoscopic investigation of spontaneous symmetry breaking in a 3D geometry. Metallic stripes are stabilized by strain-induced structural phase separation at temperatures below $T_{\text{bulk}}$, manifesting in distinct herringbone patterns of insulating and conducting regions. The formation of these patterns strongly depends on the local sample geometry and strain relaxation. Cross-sectional images reveal preferential metallic nucleation at the film/substrate interface where the epitaxial strain is the strongest, whereas planar images reveal spontaneous crystal symmetry breaking during the phase separation. Further developments of s-SNOM techniques will enable characterization of the interface/layered structure in phase separated systems at cryogenic temperatures.$^{31}$ Promising candidates of considerable interest for future study include Mott–Hubbard insulators,$^{30}$ perovskite manganites,$^{5}$ multiferroics$^{31}$ and layered superconductors.$^{2}$

M.K.L acknowledges support from Helmholtz Virtual Institute MEMRIOX. D.N.B. acknowledges support from DOE-BES. R.D.A. acknowledges support from DOE-BES under Grant No. DE-FG02-09ER46643. A.S.M. acknowledges support from the Basic Energy Sciences initiative of the U.S. Dept. of Energy (DOE-BES). E.A. acknowledges support from Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia, Portugal, through a doctoral degree fellowship (No. SFRH/BD/47847/2008). S.K., J.L., and S.A.W. are grateful for the support from the Nanoelectronics Research Initiative (NRI) and VMEC.
Within a single phase Mott picture, one expects $T_{\text{global}} > 340\,\text{K}$ for VO$_2$ films deposited on [110]$_R$ and [100]$_R$ TiO$_2$ substrates (with an overall tensile strain along $c_R$). One also anticipates $T_{\text{global}} < 340\,\text{K}$ for films deposited on [011]$_R$ and [001]$_R$ TiO$_2$ substrates due to an overall compressive strain along $c_R$.8,34,35,53–56 As clearly demonstrated in Figures 2–4, the spontaneous 3D strain redistribution at mesoscopic scales amends the general trend of this semi-empirical “$T_{\text{global}}$”-strain relationship previously observed.8,34,35